Evolution ohne zelluläre Strukturen Szenen aus einer RNA-Welt

Peter Schuster

Institut für Theoretische Chemie, Universität Wien, Österreich und The Santa Fe Institute, Santa Fe, New Mexico, USA



Seminar: Evolution – Im Mittelpukt der Mensch

Martin Luther UniversitätHalle (Saale), 10.05.2010

Web-Page for further information:

http://www.tbi.univie.ac.at/~pks





The thiamine-pyrophosphate riboswitch

S. Thore, M. Leibundgut, N. Ban. *Science* **312**:1208-1211, 2006.







M. Mandal, B. Boese, J.E. Barrick, W.C. Winkler, R.R, Breaker. Cell 113:577-586 (2003)

ENCODE stands for **ENC**yclopedia Of **DNA** Elements.

ENCODE Project Consortium. Identification and analysis of functional elements in 1% of the human genome by the ENCODE pilot project. *Nature* 447:799-816, 2007

DECODING THE BLUEPRINT

The ENCODE pilot maps human genome function

14 June 2007 | www.nature.com/nature | £10

Histone-modification chromatin IP

MARS'S ANCIENT OCEAN Polar wander solves an enigma

THE INTERNATIONAL WEEKLY JOURNAL OF SCIENCE

1

THE DEPTHS OF DISGUST Understanding the ugliest emotion

> MENTORING How to be top

> > NATUREJOBS Contract research



- 1. RNA-Replication *in vitro* und *in vivo*
- 2. Evolution von RNA-Molekülen
- 3. RNA-Sequenzen and -strukturen
- 4. Evolutionäre Optimierung von RNA-Strukturen

- 1. RNA-Replication in vitro und in vivo
- 2. Evolution von RNA-Molekülen
- 3. RNA-Sequenzen and -strukturen
- 4. Evolutionäre Optimierung von RNA-Strukturen

Evolution of RNA molecules based on $Q\beta$ phage

D.R.Mills, R.L.Peterson, S.Spiegelman, *An extracellular Darwinian experiment with a self-duplicating nucleic acid molecule*. Proc.Natl.Acad.Sci.USA **58** (1967), 217-224

S.Spiegelman, *An approach to the experimental analysis of precellular evolution*. Quart.Rev.Biophys. **4** (1971), 213-253

C. Weissmann, *The making of a phage*. FEBS Letters 40 (1974), S10-S18

C.K.Biebricher, *Darwinian selection of self-replicating RNA molecules*. Evolutionary Biology **16** (1983), 1-52

G.Bauer, H.Otten, J.S.McCaskill, *Travelling waves of* in vitro *evolving RNA*. *Proc.Natl.Acad.Sci.USA* **86** (1989), 7937-7941

C.K.Biebricher, W.C.Gardiner, *Molecular evolution of RNA* in vitro. Biophysical Chemistry **66** (1997), 179-192

G.Strunk, T.Ederhof, *Machines for automated evolution experiments* in vitro based on the serial transfer concept. Biophysical Chemistry 66 (1997), 193-202

F.Öhlenschlager, M.Eigen, 30 years later – A new approach to Sol Spiegelman's and Leslie Orgel's in vitro evolutionary studies. Orig.Life Evol.Biosph. 27 (1997), 437-457

RNA sample



Stock solution: $Q\beta$ RNA-replicase, ATP, CTP, GTP and UTP, buffer

Application of serial transfer to RNA evolution in vitro



The increase in RNA production rate during a serial transfer experiment

Vol. 66 Nos. 2-3 Completing vol. 66 30 JUNE 1997

ISSN 0301-4622 BICIAZ 66(2-3) 67-290 (1997)

Biophysical Chemistry

An International Journal devoted to the Physics and Chemistry of Biological Phenomena

SPECIAL ISSUE

See this lournal on the More Made Medi **EVOLUTIONARY BIOTECHNOLOGY** - FROM THEORY TO EXPERIMENT A. WATTS AND G. SCHWARZ (EDITORS)

ELSEVIER

A collection of reviews on evolution in vitro and in silico



Stock solution:

activated monomers, **ATP, CTP, GTP, UTP (TTP);** a replicase, an enzyme that performs complemantary replication; buffer solution

The flowreactor is a device for **studies** of evolution *in vitro* and *in silico*.





James D. Watson, 1928-, and Francis H.C. Crick, 1916-2004

Nobel prize 1962

1953 – 2003 fifty years double helix

The three-dimensional structure of a short double helical stack of B-DNA



Complementary replication is the simplest copying mechanism of RNA.

Complementarity is determined by Watson-Crick base pairs:

G≡C and A=U



$$\frac{dx_1}{dt} = f_2 x_2 \quad \text{and} \quad \frac{dx_2}{dt} = f_1 x_1$$

$$x_{1} = \sqrt{f_{2}} \xi_{1}, \quad x_{2} = \sqrt{f_{1}} \xi_{2}, \quad \zeta = \xi_{1} + \xi_{2}, \quad \eta = \xi_{1} - \xi_{2}, \quad f = \sqrt{f_{1}f_{2}}$$
$$\eta(t) = \eta(0) e^{-ft}$$

$$\zeta(t) = \zeta(0) e^{ft}$$

Complementary replication as the simplest molecular mechanism of reproduction



FEBS Letters **40** (1974), S10-S18

C.K. Biebricher, R. Luce. 1992. *In vitro* recombination and terminal recombination of RNA by Qβ replicase. *The EMBO Journal* 11:5129-5135.

J. Demez. European and mediterranean plant protection organization archive. France

R.W. Hammond, R.A. Owens. Molecular Plant Pathology Laboratory, US Department of Agriculture

Plant damage by viroids

1. RNA-Replication *in vitro* und *in vivo*

- 2. Evolution von RNA-Molekülen
- 3. RNA-Sequenzen and -strukturen
- 4. Evolutionäre Optimierung von RNA-Strukturen

DIE NATURWISSENSCHAFTEN

58. Jahrgang, 1971

Heft to Oktober

Selforganization of Matter and the Evolution of Biological Macromolecules

MANFRED EDGEN*

Max-Planck-Institut für Biophysikalische Chemie Karl-Friedrich-Bonhoeffer-Institut, Göttingen-Nikolausberg

J. Istrobustion J. Laward Effect J. Cause and Effect Selforganization 465 J. Purrequiatus of Selforganization J. J. Selvedinia Must Start Tron Datadeen Events 47 J.2.3. Selection J. Selection	F. Selbeganisations eta Capita Carloynis: Prostras
77 Block involution Theory of Solution (77)	Fit anyoning sy theore can provide the second second
11. Photometrogetal Theory of Statebox	VI.1 The Requirement of Cooperation between Nucleic
IL1. The Consept "Information"	Acids and Proteins
II.4. Quality Factor and Error Distribution 480	VI.3. On the Origin of the Code
ILG. Kinetics of Selection	VII. Exclution Experiments
III. Stachastic Approach to Selection	VIL1. The Off-Replicase System
TTLA Limitations of a Deterministic Theory of Selection, 484	VII.5. Department Evolution in the Test Tabe 513
111.a. Westerstare around Vanillation States 454	VII.1. Department in the set and
111.2. Photoshine in the freedo firsts	VII.5. Qualitative Selection States
111.3. Principations in the Society Score	VILA. Junifold Experiments
111.4. Stothastic models as marinov chains	VIII Condusion 515
111.5. Quantitative Discussion of Takee Prototypes of	New Contraction of the Contracti
Selection:	VIII.5. Limits of Linkory
IV Sollowanisation Read on Combinations Records	villi2. The concept - value
Van Nadala daida	VIII.3. "Dissipation" and the "Origin of Information" 516
How, reacting a second se	VIII.4. The Photoples of Selection and Evolution 517
IV.4. Irue Selfinstruction 400	VIII.5. Indeterminate , but Incynable
IV.2. Complementary instruction and Selection 402	VIII.6. Can the Phenomenon of Life be Explained by Oar
(Linery)	resent concepts of royacar
Duta)	IX. Deutsche Zuranneenfassung
IV.3.1. Single Pair Formation 494	Second
IV.3.2. Cooperative Interactions in Oligo- and	Acknowledgements
Polyancisotidas	
IV.1.1. Conclusions about Recognition 496	Literature

I. Introduction

I.I. .. Cause and Ethed"

The question about the origin of life often appears as The question about the origin of like often appears as a question about "cause and effect". Physical theories of macroscopic processes usually involve answers to such questions, even if a statistical interpretation is given to the relation between "cause" and "effect". It is mainly due to the nature of this question that many scientists believe that our present physics does not offer any obvious explanation for the existence of life,

* Partly presented as the "Robbins Lectures" at Pomona College, California, in spring 1970. 33a Natural dather, 1771

Max-Planck-Institut für biorhysikalische Chemie, D.3400 Göttingen

A Principle of Natural Self-Organization

Part A: Emergence of the Hypercycle

Die Naturwissenschaften

Manfred Eigen Peter Schuster

The Hypercycle

Institut für theoretische Chemie und Strahlenchemie der Universität, A-1090 Wien

This paper is the first part of a trilogy, which comprises a detailed This paper is the first part of a tribuy, which comprises a detailed undy of a special type of hunational expansions and detailed in relevance with respect to the origin and evolution of like. Self-replacifier macrotrobicules, such as RNA or DNA in a suit-able environment child a behavior, which as may call Daratisian and which can be formally represented by the concept of the quasipears. A quasi-species is defined as a given distribution of macro-molecular species with closely interrelated arquences, dominated by one or several (degenerate) reaster copies. External constraints enforce the solution of the best adapted distribution, commonly referred to as the wild-type. Most important for Darwniss behav-ior are the offerin for internal stability of the quasi-species. It these criteria are violated, the information stored in the nucleotidi them expanses the ensater and an information stored in the indextone requerts of the ensater and will distinguish proversity boding to an error exclusivelyby. As a consequence, selection and evolution of RNA or DNA storewise is limited with respect to the amount of information that can be stored in a single replicative unit. An analysis of experimental data transding RNA and DNA reducation surges or reperimentation regioning reset can below reproduce at various levels of ceganization reveals, that a sufficient amount of information for the build up of a innolation tracking can be goined only via integration of several different replicative units. the prime only on megation become increase represent represent with the reproductive cycles) belong biocreased linkings: A stable func-tional imagination then will mass the system to a new level of originations and literity colling at similarity increasing consider-ably. The hypercycle appears to be such a form of organization.

Previou on Part B.: The Abstract Honescocks

The mathematical analysis of dynamical syncers using methods of differential topology, yields the result that there is only one type of multinorms wheth itsfifts the differing requirements: The information stored in each single replication unit (or reproductive cycle) must be maintained, i.e., the respective master corries must compete favorably with their error distributions. Despite their competitive behavior these units must evaluate the Degree care which includes all functionally integrated spectra. On the other hand, the typic at a whole erost continue to compete strongly with any other single entity or linked assemble which does not inhuse to its interreted function common sense and tractory. These requirements are cracial for a selection of the best adapted functionally linked ensemble and its evolutive optimization. Only

Naturwissenschaften 64, 541-565 (1977) O by Springer-Verlag 197

hypertryclic communitors are able to fulfil these requirements. Nor cycle inkages among the autonomous reproduction cycles, such as chains or branched, true-like networks are devoid of such prop-The mathematical methods used for moving these associations are

64. Jahrgang Heft 11 November 1977

fixed-point, Lyapenov- and trajectorial analysis in higher-dimen-sional phase spaces, spentred by the concentration coordinates of the cooperating partners. The self-organizing properties of hypercythey are elucidated, using analytical as well as numerical technique

Preview on Part C: The Realistic Repercycle

A realistic model of a hypercricic relevant with research to the origin the gravitic code and the translation unschinery is presented includes the following features referring to natural system: It The hyperbody has a sufficiently simple structure to admit an origination, with finite probability under probability inder probability inder probability and a probability and a probability of a conditional of the probability of a conditional temperate from closely internetated (0-RNA-like) precursors, originally being members of a stable RNA. quari-species and having been amplified to a level of higher aban

masse. Jy The organizational structure and the properties of single fano-tional units of this hypercycle are still reflected in the present genetic code in the translation apparatus of the prokaryotic cell, as well as in certain bacterial vipues.

J. The Paradigm of Unity and Diversity in Evolution

Why do millions of species, plants and animals, exist, while there is only one basic molecular machinery of the cell: one universal genetic code and unique chiralities of the macromolecules? The geneticists of our day would not hesitate to give an immediate answere to the first part of this ques-

tion. Diversity of species is the outcome of the tremen dous branching process of evolution with its myriads of single steps of reproduction and mutation. It in-

Reprinted from The Journal of Physical Chemistry, 1988, 92, 6881. Copyright © 1988 by the American Chemical Society and reprinted by permission of the copyright owner

Molecular Quasi-Species[†]

Manfred Eigen,* John McCaskill,

Max Planck Institut für biophysikalische Chemie, Am Fassberg, D 3400 Göttingen-Nikolausberg, BRD

and Peter Schuster

Institut für theoretische Chemie und Strahlenchemie, der Universität Wien, Währinger Strasse 17, A-1090 Wien, Austria (Received: June 9, 1988)

The molecular quasi-species model describes the physicochemical segarization of nonsmann into an ensemble of heteropolymers with combinatorial completely by oragoing template polymerization. Physicolotides belong the h-simplet class of such molecular. The quasi-species itself represents the stationary furthroution of monetomical respectors maintained by deminist reactions effecting error-proto exploration and by transport processes. It is obtained deterministically, by mass-action likencies, and the statistical physical deterministical exploration or equipates the statistical physical deterministical deterministical physical deterministical deterministical physical deterministical physical deterministical physical deterministical physical deterministical physical deterministical physical physical deterministical physical deterministical physical physical deterministical physical deterministical physical physical physical determinist

1. Molecular Selection

 Milecular Selection
 Our koovelege of physical and chemical systems is, in a final
 analysis, based on models derived from repeatable experiments.
 While none of the classic and rather besigned lite of properties
 resuded up to support the institution of a distinction between the
 iming and nonliving-metholoism, affer production, trirthability,
 and adaptability, for example—institutional with the application
 the solutific module, a determining model with the properties
 or the solutific module, a determining model, with the the solutific module and
 entities comes into conflict with the requirement of repeatability,
 reversely and mumbers of different tentilies to ecorrows that nothers
 reversely and manife physical realizations in possible. The
 providen numbers of different entities so enormous that neither consecutive nor pracified physical realizations is possible. The physical chemistry of finite systems of auch macromolecules must physical chemistry of finite systems of auch macromolecules and physical suggestions. Normally this would present to difficulty in a satisficial mechanical analysis of typical behavior, where rare event physio solgrificant role, but with autoatathylic polymeri-zation processes even unique single molecules may be amplified othermine the faits of the neutro system. Postnählly creative, self-organizing around unique events, the dynamics of this simplest living chemical system is invested with regularities that both allow and limit efficient adaptation. The quasi-species model is a study

and time encourse augmenter to quark space of these regularities. The fundamental regularity in living organisms so that has invited explanation is adaptation. Why are organisms so well fitted to their environments? At a more chemical level, why are enzymes

the interactive of this maintain clientical model is an encountery Darwise recognition that new inheritation dapping representative reported on the environment but arose independently in the roboticsion of officing. Lasting adaptive changes in a population could only come about by natural selection of the heritable trains or problem of the life characteristic or phenotype relevant for probleming offspring. A process of chance, L, auccorrelated removes the particular of the phenotype relevant for probleming the phenotype relevant for probleming the phenotype relevant for probleming of the phenotype relevant phenotype, the problem of dening with a huge number of variants. The formulation of a tractable chemical model hased on Duarving principle may be understood in several steps: 1. The main constituents of the system have to be inherently self-reproductive. Only two classes of molecules are presently self-reproductive. Only two classes of molecules are presently ¹This is an abridged account of the quasi-species theory that has been (1) Eigen, M.; McCaskill, J. S.; Schuster, P. Adv. Chem. Phys., in press

0022-3654/88/2092-6881501.50/0 @ 1988 American Chemical Society

optimal catalysts? Darwin's theory of natural selection has provided biologists with a framework for the answer to this particular procession and the constructed along Darwinnia lines but in terms of specific macromolecules, chemical reactions, and bypical processes that mark the notion of survival of the fittest precise. Not only does the model give an understanding of the physica brooked chemes in the model give an understanding of the physica brooked chemes in the movement. For an understanding the physica brooked of themes in the movement. For an understanding the

into the role of chance in the process. For an understanding of the structure of this minimal chemical model it is first necessary to recall the conceptual basis of Darwin's theory.

1988

Chemical kinetics of molecular evolution

1977

ular) systems, such as the living cell. As a consequence of the exciting discoveries of "molecular biology", a common version of the above question is: Which cause first, the protein or the nuclei sold? - a modern variant of the old "chicken-and-theegg" problem. The term "first" is usually meant to

egg 'problem. The term 'inst' is usually meant to define a causal rather than a temporal relationship, and the words "protein" and "muchic acid" may be sub-stituted by "function" and "information". The question in this form, when applied to the interplay of nucleic acids and proteins as presently encountered i the living cell, leads ad absurdum, because "function

which even in its simplest forms always appears to be associated with complex macroscopic fi.e. multimolec-

ular) systems, such as the living cell.

1971

Replication and mutation are parallel chemical reactions.

 dx_i $f_{j} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} Q_{ji} f_{i} x_{i} - x_{j} \Phi; \quad j = 1, 2, ..., n$ dt

Mutation and (correct) replication as parallel chemical reactions

M. Eigen. 1971. *Naturwissenschaften* 58:465, M. Eigen & P. Schuster.1977. *Naturwissenschaften* 64:541, 65:7 und 65:341

The error threshold in replication

Chain length and error threshold

$$Q \cdot \sigma = (1-p)^n \cdot \sigma \ge 1 \implies n \cdot \ln(1-p) \ge -\ln\sigma$$
$$p \dots \text{ constant}: \quad n_{\max} \approx \frac{\ln\sigma}{p}$$
$$n \dots \text{ constant}: \quad p_{\max} \approx \frac{\ln\sigma}{n}$$

$$Q = (1-p)^{n} \dots \text{ replication accuracy}$$

$$p \dots \text{ error rate}$$

$$n \dots \text{ chain length}$$

$$\sigma = \frac{f_{m}}{\sum_{j \neq m} f_{j}} \dots \text{ superiority of master sequence}$$

Available online at www.sciencedirect.com

Virus Research 107 (2005) 115-116

Preface Antiviral strategy on the horizon

Error catastrophe had its conceptual origins in the middle of the XXth century, when the consequences of mutations on enzymes involved in protein synthesis, as a theory of aging. In those times biological processes were generally perceived differently from today. Infectious diseases were regarded as a fleeting nuisance which would be eliminated through the use of antibiotics and antiviral agents. Microbial variation, although known in some cases, was not thought to be a significant problem for disease control. Variation in differentiated organisms was seen as resulting essentially from exchanges of genetic material associated with sexual reproduction. The problem was to unveil the mechanisms of inheritance. expression of genetic information and metabolism. Few saw that genetic change is occurring at present in all organisms. and still fewer recognized Darwinian principles as essential to the biology of pathogenic viruses and cells. Population geneticists rarely used bacteria or viruses as experimental systems to define concepts in biological evolution. The extent of genetic polymorphism among individuals of the same biological species came as a surprise when the first results on comparison of electrophoretic mobility of enzymes were obtained. With the advent of in vitro DNA recombination. and rapid nucleic acid sequencing techniques, molecular analyses of genomes reinforced the conclusion of extreme inter-individual genetic variation within the same species. Now, due largely to spectacular progress in comparative genomics, we see cellular DNAs, both prokarvotic and eukarvotic, as highly dynamic. Most cellular processes, including such essential information-bearing and transferring events as genome replication, transcription and translation, are increasingly perceived as inherently inaccurate. Viruses, and in particular RNA viruses, are among the most extreme examples of exploitation of replication inaccuracy for survival.

Error catastrophe, or the loss of meaningful genetic information through excess genetic variation, was formulated in quantitative terms as a consequence of quasispecies theory, which was first developed to explain self-organization and adaptability of primitive replicons in early stages of life. Recently, a conceptual extension of error catastrophe that could be defined as "induced genetic deterioration" has emerged as

0168-1702/S - see front matter © 2004 Elsevier B.V. All rights received.

doi:10.1016/j.virusres.2004.11.001

a possible antiviral strategy. This is the topic of the current special issue of *Virus Research*.

Few would nowadays doubt that one of the major obstacles for the control of viral disease is short-term adaptability of viral pathogens. Adaptability of viruses follows the same Darwinian principles that have shaped biological evolution over eons, that is, repeated rounds of reproduction with genetic variation, competition and selection, often perturbed by random events such as statistical fluctuations in population size. However, with viruses the consequences of the operation of these very same Darwinian principles are felt within very short times. Short-term evolution (within hours and days) can be also observed with some cellular pathogens, with subsets of normal cells, and cancer cells. The nature of RNA viral pathogens begs for alternative antiviral strategies, and forcing the virus to cross the critical error threshold for maintenance of genetic information is one of them.

The contributions to this volume have been chosen to reflect different lines of evidence (both theoretical and experimental) on which antiviral designs based on genetic deterioration inflicted upon viruses are being constructed. Theoretical studies have explored the copying fidelity conditions that must be fulfilled by any information-bearing replication system for the essential genetic information to be transmitted to progeny. Closely related to the theoretical developments have been numerous experimental studies on quasispecies dynamics and their multiple biological manifestations. The latter can be summarized by saving that RNA viruses, by virtue of existing as mutant spectra rather than defined genetic entities, remarkably expand their potential to overcome selective pressures intended to limit their replication. Indeed, the use of antiviral inhibitors in clinical practice and the design of vaccines for a number of major RNA virus-associated diseases, are currently presided by a sense of uncertainty. Another line of growing research is the enzymology of copying fidelity by viral replicases, aimed at understanding the molecular basis of mutagenic activities. Error catastrophe as a potential new antiviral strategy received an important impulse by the observation that ribavirin (a licensed antiviral nucleoside analogue) may be exerting, in some systems, its antiviral activity through enhanced mutagenesis. This has encouraged investigations on new mutagenic base analogues, some of them used in anticancer chemotherapy. Some chapters summarize these important biochemical studies on cell entry pathways and metabolism of mutagenic agents, that may find new applications as antiviral agents.

This volume intends to be basically a progress report, an introduction to a new avenue of research, and a realistic appraisal of the many issues that remain to be investigated. In this respect. I can envisage (not without many uncertainties) at least three lines of needed research: (i) One on further understanding of quasispecies dynamics in infected individuals to learn more on how to apply combinations of virus-specific mutagens and inhibitors in an effective way, finding synerzistic combinations and avoiding antagonistic ones as well as severe clinical side effects. (ii) Another on a deeper understanding of the metabolism of mutagenic agents, in particular base and nucleoside analogues. This includes identification of the transporters that carry them into cells, an understanding of their metabolic processing, intracellular stability and alterations of nucleotide pools, among other issues. (iii) Still another line of needed research is the development of new mutagenic agents specific for viruses, showing no (or limited) toxicity for cells. Some advances may come from links with anticancer research, but others should result from the designs of new molecules, based on the structures of viral polymerases. I really hope that the reader finds this issue not only to be an interesting and useful review of the current situ-

Preface / Virus Research 107 (2005) 115-116

ation in the field, but also a stimulating exposure to the major problems to be faced.

The idea to prepare this special issue came as a kind invitation of Ulrich Desselberger, former Editor of Virus Research, and then taken enthusiastically by Luis Enjuanes, recently appointed as Editor of Virus Research. I take this opportunity to thank Ulrich, Luis and the Editor-in-Chief of Virus Research, Brian Mahy, for their continued interest and support to the research on virus evolution over the years.

My thanks go also to the 19 authors who despite their busy schedules have taken time to prepare excellent manuscripts, to Elsevier staff for their prompt responses to my requests, and, last but not least, to Ms. Lucia Horrillo from Centro de Biologia Molecular "Severo Ochoa" for her patient dealing with the correspondence with authors and the final organization of the issue.

> Esteban Domingo Universidad Autónoma de Madrid Centro de Biologia Molecular "Severo Ochoa" Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas Cantoblanco and Valdeoimos Madrid, Spain Tel.: + 34 91 497 84858/9; fax: +34 91 497 4799 E-mail address: edomingo@cbm.uam.es Available online 8 December 2004

www.elsevier.com/locate/virusre

SECOND EDITION

ORIGIN AND EVOLUTION OF VIRUSES

Edited by ESTEBAN DOMINGO COLIN R. PARRISH JOHN J. HOLLAND

Molecular evolution of viruses

The linear fitness landscape shows no error threshold

Error threshold on the hyperbolic landscape

Error threshold on the single peak landscape


Error threshold on the step linear landscape

The error threshold can be separated into three phenomena:

- 1. Decrease in the concentration of the master sequence to very small values.
- 2. Sharp change in the stationary concentration of the quasispecies distribuiton.
- 3. Transition to the uniform distribution at small mutation rates.

The error threshold can be separated into three phenomena:

- 1. Decrease in the concentration of the master sequence to very small values.
- 2. Sharp change in the stationary concentration of the quasispecies distribuiton.
- 3. Transition to the uniform distribution at small mutation rates.

All three phenomena coincide for the quasispecies on the single peak fitness lanscape.



apes showing error thresh

Hamming distance $d_{H}(I_k, I_0)$

Fitness landscapes showing error thresholds





Error threshold: Individual sequences n = 10, $\sigma = 2$ and d = 0, 1.0, 1.85



Complexity in molecular evolution

- 1. RNA-Replication *in vitro* und *in vivo*
- 2. Evolution von RNA-Molekülen
- 3. RNA-Sequenzen and -strukturen
- 4. Evolutionäre Optimierung von RNA-Strukturen

INSTITUTE OF PHYSICS PUBLISHING

REPORTS ON PROGRESS IN PHYSICS

Rep. Prog. Phys. 69 (2006) 1419-1477

doi:10.1088/0034-4885/69/5/R04

Prediction of RNA secondary structures: from theory to models and real molecules

Peter Schuster^{1,2}

 ¹Institut f
ür Theoretische Chemie der Universit
ät Wien, W
ähringerstra
ße 17, A-1090 Vienna, Austria
 ²The Santa Fe Institute, 1399 Hyde Park Road, Santa Fe, NM 87501, USA

E-mail: pks@tbi.univie.ac.at

The notion of RNA (secondary) structure

- 1. Minimum free energy structure
- 2. Many sequences one structure
- 3. Suboptimal structures
- 4. Kinetic structures

The notion of RNA (secondary) structure

- 1. Minimum free energy structure
- 2. Many sequences one structure
- 3. Suboptimal structures
- 4. Kinetic structures



Minimum free energy structure

Extension of the notion of structure



A symbolic notation of RNA secondary structure that is equivalent to the conventional graphs

Monatshefte für Chemie Chemical Monthly © Springer-Verlag 1994 Printed in Austria

Fast Folding and Comparison of RNA Secondary Structures

I. L. Hofacker^{1,*}, W. Fontana³, P. F. Stadler^{1,3}, L. S. Bonhoeffer⁴, M. Tacker¹ and P. Schuster^{1,2,3}

¹ Institut für Theoretische Chemie, Universität Wien, A-1090 Wien, Austria

² Institut für Molekulare Biotechnologie, D-07745 Jena, Federal Republic of Germany

³ Santa Fe Institute, Santa Fe, NM 87501, U.S.A.

⁴ Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, South Parks Road, Oxford OX1 3PS, U.K.

Summary. Computer codes for computation and comparison of RNA secondary structures, the Vienna RNA package, are presented, that are based on dynamic programming algorithms and aim at predictions of structures with minimum free energies as well as at computations of the equilibrium partition functions and base pairing probabilities.

An efficient heuristic for the inverse folding problem of RNA is introduced. In addition we present compact and efficient programs for the comparison of RNA secondary structures based on tree editing and alignment.

All computer codes are written in ANSI C. They include implementations of modified algorithms on parallel computers with distributed memory. Performance analysis carried out on an Intel Hypercube shows that parallel computing becomes gradually more and more efficient the longer the sequences are.

Keywords. Inverse folding; parallel computing; public domain software; RNA folding; RNA secondary structures; tree editing.

The notion of RNA (secondary) structure

- 1. Minimum free energy structure
- 2. Many sequences one structure
- 3. Suboptimal structures
- 4. Kinetic structures



UUUAGCCAGCGCGAGUCGUGCGGACGGGGUUAUCUCUGUCGGGCUAGGGCGC GUGAGCGCGGGGCACAGUUUCUCAAGGAUGUAAGUUUUUGCCGUUUAUCUGG UUAGCGAGAGAGGAGGCUUCUAGACCCAGCUCUCUGGGUCGUUGCUGAUGCG CAUUGGUGCUAAUGAUAUUAGGGCUGUAUUCCUGUAUAGCGAUCAGUGUCCG GUAGGCCCUCUUGACAUAAGAUUUUUUCCAAUGGUGGGAGAUGGCCAUUGCAG

The **inverse folding algorithm** searches for sequences that form a given RNA secondary structure under the minimum free energy criterion.

From sequences to shapes and back: a case study in RNA secondary structures

PETER SCHUSTER^{1, 2, 3}, WALTER FONTANA³, PETER F. STADLER^{2, 3} and IVO L. HOFACKER²

¹ Institut für Molekulare Biotechnologie, Beutenbergstrasse 11, PF 100813, D-07708 Jena, Germany

² Institut für Theoretische Chemie, Universität Wien, Austria

³ Santa Fe Institute, Santa Fe, U.S.A.

SUMMARY

RNA folding is viewed here as a map assigning secondary structures to sequences. At fixed chain length the number of sequences far exceeds the number of structures. Frequencies of structures are highly nonuniform and follow a generalized form of Zipf's law: we find relatively few common and many rare ones. By using an algorithm for inverse folding, we show that sequences sharing the same structure are distributed randomly over sequence space. All common structures can be accessed from an arbitrary sequence by a number of mutations much smaller than the chain length. The sequence space is percolated by extensive neutral networks connecting nearest neighbours folding into identical structures. Implications for evolutionary adaptation and for applied molecular evolution are evident: finding a particular structure by mutation and selection is much simpler than expected and, even if catalytic activity should turn out to be sparse in the space of RNA structures, it can hardly be missed by evolutionary processes. Space of genotypes: $I = \{I_1, I_2, I_3, I_4, ..., I_N\}$; Hamming metric Space of phenotypes: $S = \{S_1, S_2, S_3, S_4, ..., S_M\}$; metric (not required) $N \gg M$

 $\psi(I_j) = S_k$ $\mathbf{G}_k = \psi^{-1}(S_k) \cup \left\{ \mathbf{I}_j \mid \psi(I_j) = S_k \right\}$

A mapping ψ and its inversion





S0092-8240(96)00089-4

GENERIC PROPERTIES OF COMBINATORY MAPS: NEUTRAL NETWORKS OF RNA SECONDARY STRUCTURES¹

 CHRISTIAN REIDYS*, †, PETER F. STADLER*, ‡ and PETER SCHUSTER*, ‡, §,²
 *Santa Fe Institute, Santa Fe, NM 87501, U.S.A.

[†]Los Alamos National Laboratory, Los Alamos, NM 87545, U.S.A.

‡Institut für Theoretische Chemie der Universität Wien, A-1090 Wien, Austria

§Institut f
ür Molekulare Biotechnologie, D-07708 Jena, Germany

(E.mail: pks@tbi.univie.ac.at)

Random graph theory is used to model and analyse the relationships between sequences and secondary structures of RNA molecules, which are understood as mappings from sequence space into shape space. These maps are non-invertible since there are always many orders of magnitude more sequences than structures. Sequences folding into identical structures form neutral networks. A neutral network is embedded in the set of sequences that are compatible with the given structure. Networks are modeled as graphs and constructed by random choice of vertices from the space of compatible sequences. The theory characterizes neutral networks by the mean fraction of neutral neighbors (λ). The networks are connected and percolate sequence space if the fraction of neutral nearest neighbors exceeds a threshold value $(\lambda > \lambda^*)$. Below threshold $(\lambda < \lambda^*)$, the networks are partitioned into a largest "giant" component and several smaller components. Structures are classified as "common" or "rare" according to the sizes of their pre-images, i.e. according to the fractions of sequences folding into them. The neutral networks of any pair of two different common structures almost touch each other, and, as expressed by the conjecture of shape space covering sequences folding into almost all common structures, can be found in a small ball of an arbitrary location in sequence space. The results from random graph theory are compared to data obtained by folding large samples of RNA sequences. Differences are explained in terms of specific features of RNA molecular structures. © 1997 Society for Mathematical Biology

Evolution of aptamers with a new specificity and new secondary structures from an ATP aptamer

ZHEN HUANG¹ and JACK W. SZOSTAK²

¹Department of Chemistry, Brooklyn College, Ph.D. Programs of Chemistry and Biochemistry, The Graduate School of CUNY, Brooklyn, New York 11210, USA

²Howard Hughes Medical Institute, Department of Molecular Biology, Massachusetts General Hospital, Boston, Massachusetts 02114, USA

ABSTRACT

Small changes in target specificity can sometimes be achieved, without changing aptamer structure, through mutation of a few bases. Larger changes in target geometry or chemistry may require more radical changes in an aptamer. In the latter case, it is unknown whether structural and functional solutions can still be found in the region of sequence space close to the original aptamer. To investigate these questions, we designed an in vitro selection experiment aimed at evolving specificity of an ATP aptamer. The ATP aptamer makes contacts with both the nucleobase and the sugar. We used an affinity matrix in which GTP was immobilized through the sugar, thus requiring extensive changes in or loss of sugar contact, as well as changes in recognition of the nucleobase. After just five rounds of selection, the pool was dominated by new aptamers falling into three major classes, each with secondary structures distinct from that of the ATP aptamer. The average sequence identity between the original aptamer and new aptamers is 76%. Most of the mutations appear to play roles either in disrupting the original secondary structures that recognize a significantly different ligand in the region of sequence space close to the ATP aptamer. These examples of the emergence of novel functions and structures from an RNA molecule with a defined specificity and fold provide a new perspective on the evolutionary flexibility and adaptability of RNA.

Keywords: Aptamer; specificity; fold; selection; RNA evolution

RNA **9**:1456-1463, 2003

Evidence for neutral networks and shape space covering



Evolutionary Landscapes for the Acquisition of New Ligand Recognition by RNA Aptamers

Daniel M. Held, S. Travis Greathouse, Amit Agrawal, Donald H. Burke

Department of Chemistry, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405-7102, USA

Received: 15 November 2002 / Accepted: 8 April 2003

Abstract. The evolution of ligand specificity underlies many important problems in biology, from the appearance of drug resistant pathogens to the re-engineering of substrate specificity in enzymes. In studying biomolecules, however, the contributions of macromolecular sequence to binding specificity can be obscured by other selection pressures critical to bioactivity. Evolution of ligand specificity in vitro-unconstrained by confounding biological factors-is addressed here using variants of three flavin-binding RNA aptamers. Mutagenized pools based on the three aptamers were combined and allowed to compete during in vitro selection for GMP-binding activity. The sequences of the resulting selection isolates were diverse, even though most were derived from the same flavin-binding parent. Individual GMP aptamers differed from the parental flavin aptamers by 7 to 26 mutations (20 to 57% overall change). Acquisition of GMP recognition coincided with the loss of FAD (flavin-adenine dinucleotide) recognition in all isolates, despite the absence of a counter-selection to remove FAD-binding RNAs. To examine more precisely the proximity of these two activities within a defined sequence space, the complete set of all intermediate sequences between an FAD-binding aptamer and a GMP-binding aptamer were synthesized and assayed for activity. For this set of sequences, we observe a portion of a neutral network for FAD-binding function separated from GMP-binding function by a distance of three mutations. Furthermore, enzymatic probing of these aptamers revealed gross structural remodeling of the RNA coincident with the switch in ligand recognition. The capacity for neutral drift along an FAD-binding network in such close approach to RNAs with GMPbinding activity illustrates the degree of phenotypic buffering available to a set of closely related RNA sequences—defined as the set's functional tolerance for point mutations—and supports neutral evolutionary theory by demonstrating the facility with which a new phenotype becomes accessible as that buffering threshold is crossed.

Key words: Aptamers — RNA structure — Phenotypic buffering — Fitness landscapes — Neutral evolutionary theory — Flavin — GMP

Introduction

RNA aptamers targeting small molecules serve as useful model systems for the study of the evolution and biophysics of macromolecular binding interactions. Because of their small sizes, the structures of several such complexes have been determined to atomic resolution by NMR spectrometry or X-ray crystallography (reviewed by Herman and Patel 2000). Moreover, aptamers can be subjected to mutational and evolutionary pressures for which survival is based entirely on ligand binding, without the complicating effects of simultaneous selection pressures for bioactivity, thus allowing the relative contributions of each activity to be evaluated separately.

Evidence for neutral networks and intersection of apatamer functions

Correspondence to: Donald H. Burke; email: dhburke@indiana.edu



An example of 'artificial selection' with RNA molecules or 'breeding' of biomolecules



tobramycin



Formation of secondary structure of the tobramycin binding RNA aptamer with $K_D = 9 nM$

L. Jiang, A. K. Suri, R. Fiala, D. J. Patel, *Saccharide-RNA recognition in an aminoglycoside antibiotic-RNA aptamer complex.* Chemistry & Biology **4**:35-50 (1997)



The three-dimensional structure of the tobramycin aptamer complex

L. Jiang, A. K. Suri, R. Fiala, D. J. Patel, Chemistry & Biology **4**:35-50 (1997)





Donald Hilvert.

Schematic overview of the principal processes, strategies, and techniques of directed evolution. Today, numerous experimental methods are available to perform the fundamental processes of true Darwinian evolution (central boxes) in the laboratory, either in vivo within microorganisms or entirely in vitro in the test tube. Arrows indicate possible routes for connecting individual evolutionary steps. Abbreviations: PCR, polymerase chain reaction; RT-PCR, reverse transcription PCR; IVC, in vitro compartmentalization: FACS. fluorescenceactivated cell sorting.

WILEY-VCH

Directed Molecular Evolution of Proteins

or How to Improve Enzymes for Biocatalysis

Edited by Susanne Brakmann and Kai Johnsson





Application of molecular evolution to problems in biotechnology

The notion of RNA (secondary) structure

- 1. Minimum free energy structure
- 2. Many sequences one structure
- 3. Suboptimal structures
- 4. Kinetic structures



Minimum free energy structure

Suboptimal structures

Extension of the notion of structure

Stefan Wuchty¹ Walter Fontana^{1,2} Ivo L. Hofacker¹ Peter Schuster^{1,2} ¹ Institut für Theoretische Chemie, Universität Wien, Währingerstrasse 17, A-1090 Wien, Austria

² Santa Fe Institute, 1399 Hyde Park Road, Santa Fe, NM 87501 USA

> Received 13 May 1998; accepted 6 August 1998

Complete Suboptimal Folding of RNA and the Stability of Secondary Structures

Abstract: An algorithm is presented for generating rigorously all suboptimal secondary structures between the minimum free energy and an arbitrary upper limit. The algorithm is particularly fast in the vicinity of the minimum free energy. This enables the efficient approximation of statistical quantities, such as the partition function or measures for structural diversity. The density of states at low energies and its associated structures are crucial in assessing from a thermodynamic point of view how well-defined the ground state is. We demonstrate this by exploring the role of base modification in tRNA secondary structures, both at the level of individual sequences from Escherichia coli and by comparing artificially generated ensembles of modified and unmodified sequences with the same tRNA structure. The two major conclusions are that (1) base modification considerably sharpens the definition of the ground state structure by constraining energetically adjacent structures to be similar to the ground state, and (2) sequences whose ground state structure is thermodynamically well defined show a significant tendency to buffer single point mutations. This can have evolutionary implications, since selection pressure to improve the definition of ground states with biological function may result in increased neutrality. © 1999 John Wiley & Sons, Inc. Biopoly 49: 145–165, 1999

Keywords: RNA secondary structure; suboptimal folding; density of states; tRNA; modified bases; thermodynamic stability of structure; mutational buffering; neutrality; dynamic programming

$\mathsf{GGCUAUCGUACGUUUAC}^{\mathbf{C}}\mathsf{CAAAAGUCUACGUUGGACCCAGGCA}^{\mathbf{U}\mathsf{U}\mathsf{G}\mathsf{G}\mathsf{A}\mathsf{C}\mathsf{G}}$

((((((((((((((((((((((())))))))))))))))	-7.30
$\dots \dots \dots (((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((($	-6.70
$\dots \dots \dots (((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((($	-6.60
(((.((((((())))))))))))))))))))	-6.10
((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((-6.00
((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((-6.00
((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((-6.00

ggcuaucguacguuuacAcaaaagucuacguuggacccaggcaUuggacg

(((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((7.30
((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((6.50
$((((\dots, (((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((($	6.30
\dots (((.((((((())))))))))))))))))))))	6.10
(((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((()6.00
((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((6.00
$((((\dots (((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((($	6.00

 $\mathsf{GGCUAUCGUACGUUUAC}^{\mathbf{C}}\mathsf{CAAAAGUCUACGUUGGACCCAGGCA}\mathsf{AUGGACG}$

((((((((.	.(((.	•••	•••	•]))).	••))))	.))).)).	•	•	• •	•	•	•••	•	•	• •	•	-7.30
(((.(((.	.(((.			•)))).))))	.))).		((()))				-7.20
	. ((((((. ((.			()	((())))		•)).)))))))	-6.70
	. ((((((. ((.			()	((((.		.)))))		•)).)))))))	-6.60
((((((((.	.(((.			•)))).))))	.))).)) (())					-6.50
(.(((.(((.	.(((.			•)))).))))	.))).)	((()))				-6.30
.(((((((.	.(((.			•)))).))))	.))).)	((()))				-6.30
(((.	((((.	. ((.)).))))))).		((()))				-6.30
(.(((.(((.	.(((.			•))).))))	.))).		(((•)))).	•	-6.10
((((((.	((.		•)).	•)))).	•))		(((•			•)))	•	• •	•	-6.10
(((. ((((. ((.	•		()	(((•))))	• •	• •)).))))))))	-6.10
((((((((.	.(((.			•))).))))	.))).)).	• •	(•		•	•).	•	-6.00
((((((((.	.((•	.)).))))	.))).)).	• •				•		•		• •	•	-6.00
.(((.((.	((((.	((.		•)).	•)))).	•))	•	• •	• •)))		•		•	•	• •	•	-6.00
(((. ((((. ((.	•		()	((((.	•	.)))))	• •	•)).))))	•))))	-6.00



The notion of RNA (secondary) structure

- 1. Minimum free energy structure
- 2. Many sequences one structure
- 3. Suboptimal structures
- 4. Kinetic structures



Extension of the notion of structure

RNA (2000), 6:325–338. Cambridge University Press. Printed in the USA. Copyright © 2000 RNA Society.

RNA folding at elementary step resolution

CHRISTOPH FLAMM,¹ WALTER FONTANA,^{2,3} IVO L. HOFACKER,¹ and PETER SCHUSTER¹

¹Institut für Theoretische Chemie und Molekulare Strukturbiologie, Universität Wien, A-1090 Wien, Austria ²Santa Fe Institute, Santa Fe, New Mexico 87501 USA

ABSTRACT

We study the stochastic folding kinetics of RNA sequences into secondary structures with a new algorithm based on the formation, dissociation, and the shifting of individual base pairs. We discuss folding mechanisms and the correlation between the barrier structure of the conformational landscape and the folding kinetics for a number of examples based on artificial and natural sequences, including the influence of base modification in tRNAs.

Keywords: conformational spaces; foldability; RNA folding kinetics; RNA secondary structure



Definition of a ,barrier tree'

Structural parameters affecting the kinetics of RNA hairpin formation

J. H. A. Nagel, C. Flamm¹, I. L. Hofacker¹, K. Franke², M. H. de Smit, P. Schuster¹ and C. W. A. Pleij*

Leiden Institute of Chemistry, Gorlaeus Laboratories, Leiden University, 2300 RA Leiden, The Netherlands, ¹Institut für Theoretische Chemie und Molekulare Strukturbiologie, Universität Wien, A-1090 Vienna, Austria and ²IBA NAPS GmbH Rudolf-Wissell-Strasse 28 D-37079 Göttingen, Germany

Received January 28, 2005; Revised and Accepted June 7, 2006

ABSTRACT

There is little experimental knowledge on the sequence dependent rate of hairpin formation in RNA. We have therefore designed RNA sequences that can fold into either of two mutually exclusive hairpins and have determined the ratio of folding of the two conformations, using structure probing. This folding ratio reflects their respective folding rates. Changing one of the two loop sequences from a purine- to a pyrimidine-rich loop did increase its folding rate, which corresponds well with similar observations in DNA hairpins. However, neither changing one of the loops from a regular non-GNRA tetra-loop into a stable GNRA tetra-loop, nor increasing the loop size from 4 to 6 nt did affect the folding rate. The folding kinetics of these RNAs have also been simulated with the program 'Kinfold'. These simulations were in agreement with the experimental results if the additional stabilization energies for stable tetra-loops were not taken into account. Despite the high stability of the stable tetra-loops, they apparently do not affect folding kinetics of these RNA hairpins. These results show that it is possible to experimentally determine relative folding rates of hairpins and to use these data to improve the computer-assisted simulation of the folding kinetics of stem-loop structures.



An experimental RNA switch


J1LH barrier tree

A ribozyme switch

E.A.Schultes, D.B.Bartel, Science **289** (2000), 448-452

minus the background levels observed in the HSP in the control (Sar1-GDP-containing) incubation that prevents COPII vesicle formation. In the microsome control, the level of p115-SNARE associations was

- less than 0.1%.
 46. C. M. Carr, E. Grote, M. Munson, F. M. Hughson, P. J. Novick, J. Cell Biol. 146, 333 (1999).
- C. Ungermann, B. J. Nichols, H. R. Pelham, W. Wickner, J. Cell Biol. 140, 61 (1998).
- 48. E. Grote and P. J. Novick, Mol. Biol. Cell 10, 4149 (1999).
- 49. P. Uetz et al., Nature 403, 623 (2000).
- 50. GST-SNARE proteins were expressed in bacteria and purified on glutathione-Sepharose beads using standard methods. Immobilized GST-SNARE protein (0.5 μM) was incubated with rat liver cytosol (20 mg) or purified recombinant p115 (0.5 μM) in 1 ml of NS buffer containing 1% BSA for 2 hours at 4°C with rotation. Beads were briefly spun (3000 rpm for 10.3) and sequentially washed three times with NS buffer and three times with NS buffer supplemented with 150 ml NaCL Bound proteins were eluted three times in 50 μJ of 50 ml tris-HCI (pH 8.5), 50 ml reduced glutathione, 150 ml NaCL, and 0.1% Tirtion 0.1% proteins were and the standard of 1% Tirtion

REPORTS

- X-100 for 15 min at 4°C with Intermittent mixing, and elutes were pooled. Proteins were precipitated by MeOH/CH₃Cl and separated by SDS-polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis (PAGE) followed by immunoblotting using p115 mAb 13F12.
- 51. V. Rybin et al., Nature 383, 266 (1996).
- K. G. Hardwick and H. R. Pelham, J. Cell Biol. 119, 513 (1992).
- A. P. Newman, M. E. Groesch, S. Ferro-Novick, EMBO J. 11, 3609 (1992).
- A. Spang and R. Schekman, J. Cell Biol. 143, 589 (1998).
 M. F. Rexach, M. Latterich, R. W. Schekman, J. Cell
- Biol. 126, 1133 (1994).
 56. A. Mayer and W. Wickner, J. Cell Biol. 136, 307 (1997).
 57. M. D. Turner, H. Plutner, W. E. Balch, J. Biol. Chem.
- 272, 13479 (1997). 58. A. Price, D. Seals, W. Wickner, C. Ungermann, J. Cell
- Biol. 148, 1231 (2000). 59. X. Cao and C. Barlowe, J. Cell Biol. 149, 55 (2000).
- G. G. Tall, H. Hama, D. B. DeWald, B. F. Horazdovsky, Mol. Biol. Cell 10, 1873 (1999).
- C. G. Burd, M. Peterson, C. R. Cowles, S. D. Emr, Mol. Biol. Cell 8, 1089 (1997).

One Sequence, Two Ribozymes: Implications for the Emergence of New Ribozyme Folds

Erik A. Schultes and David P. Bartel*

We describe a single RNA sequence that can assume either of two ribozyme folds and catalyze the two respective reactions. The two ribozyme folds share no evolutionary history and are completely different, with no base pairs (and probably no hydrogen bonds) in common. Minor variants of this sequence are highly active for one or the other reaction, and can be accessed from prototype ribozymes through a series of neutral mutations. Thus, in the course of evolution, new RNA folds could arise from preexisting folds, without the need to carry inactive intermediate sequences. This raises the possibility that biological RNAs having no structural or functional similarity might share a common ancestry. Furthermore, functional and structural divergence might, in some cases, precede rather than follow gene duplication.

Related protein or RNA sequences with the same folded conformation can often perform very different biochemical functions, indicating that new biochemical functions can arise from preexisting folds. But what evolutionary mechanisms give rise to sequences with new macromolecular folds? When considering the origin of new folds, it is useful to picture, among all sequence possibilities, the distribution of sequences with a particular fold and function. This distribution can range very far in sequence space (1). For example, only seven nucleotides are strictly conserved among the group I selfsplicing introns, yet secondary (and presumably tertiary) structure within the core of the ribozyme is preserved (2). Because these disparate isolates have the same fold and function, it is thought that they descended from a common ancestor through a series of mutational variants that were each functional. Hence, sequence heterogeneity among divergent isolates implies the existence of paths through sequence space that have allowed neutral drift from the ancestral sequence to each isolate. The set of all possible neutral paths composes a "neutral network," connecting in sequence space those widely dispersed sequences sharing a particular fold and activity, such that any sequence on the network can potentially access very distant sequences by neutral mutations (3–5).

Theoretical analyses using algorithms for predicting RNA secondary structure have suggested that different neutral networks are interwoven and can approach each other very closely (3, 5-8). Of particular interest is whether ribozyme neutral networks approach each other so closely that they intersect. If so, a single sequence would be capable of folding into two different conformations, would M. R. Peterson, C. G. Burd, S. D. Emr, Curr. Biol. 9, 159 (1999).

- M. G. Waters, D. O. Clary, J. E. Rothman, J. Cell Biol. 118, 1015 (1992).
- D. M. Walter, K. S. Paul, M. G. Waters, J. Biol. Chem. 273, 29565 (1998).
- 3 65. N. Hui et al., Mol. Biol. Cell 8, 1777 (1997).
- 66. T. E. Kreis, EMBO J. 5, 931 (1986).
- H. Plutner, H. W. Davidson, J. Saraste, W. E. Balch J. Cell Biol. 119, 1097 (1992).
- 68. D. S. Nelson et al., J. Cell Biol. 143, 319 (1998)

69. We thank G. Waters for p115 cDNA and p115 mAbs; G. Warren for p97 and p47 antibiodies; R. Scheller for rhet1, membrin, and sec22 cDNAs; H. Pluttner for excellent technical assistance; and P. Tan for help during the initial phase of this work. Supported by NIH grants CM 33301 and CM42336 and National Cancer Institute grant CA58689 (W.E.B.), a NIH National Research Service Award (B.D.M.), and a Wellcome Trust International Traveling Fellowship (B.B.A.).

20 March 2000; accepted 22 May 2000

have two different catalytic activities, and could access by neutral drift every sequence on both networks. With intersecting networks, RNAs with novel structures and activities could arise from previously existing ribozymes, without the need to carry nonfunctional sequences as evolutionary intermediates. Here, we explore the proximity of neutral networks experimentally, at the level of RNA function. We describe a close apposition of the neutral networks for the hepatitis delta virus (HDV) self-cleaving ribozyme and the class III self-ligating ribozyme.

In choosing the two ribozymes for this investigation, an important criterion was that they share no evolutionary history that might confound the evolutionary interpretations of our results. Choosing at least one artificial ribozyme ensured independent evolutionary histories. The class III ligase is a synthetic ribozyme isolated previously from a pool of random RNA sequences (9). It joins an oligonucleotide substrate to its 5' terminus. The prototype ligase sequence (Fig. 1A) is a shortened version of the most active class III variant isolated after 10 cycles of in vitro selection and evolution. This minimal construct retains the activity of the full-length isolate (10). The HDV ribozyme carries out the site-specific self-cleavage reactions needed during the life cycle of HDV, a satellite virus of hepatitis B with a circular, single-stranded RNA genome (11), The prototype HDV construct for our study (Fig. 1B) is a shortened version of the antigenomic HDV ribozyme (12), which undergoes self-cleavage at a rate similar to that reported for other antigenomic constructs (13, 14).

The prototype class III and HDV ribozymes have no more than the 25% sequence identity expected by chance and no fortuitous structural similarities that might favor an intersection of their two neutral networks. Nevertheless, sequences can be designed that simultaneously satisfy the base-pairing requirements

Whitehead Institute for Biomedical Research and Department of Biology, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 9 Cambridge Center, Cambridge, MA 02142, USA.

^{*}To whom correspondence should be addressed. Email: dbartel@wi.mit.edu



Two ribozymes of chain lengths n = 88 nucleotides: An artificial ligase (A) and a natural cleavage ribozyme of hepatitis- δ -virus (B)



The sequence at the *intersection*:

An RNA molecules which is 88 nucleotides long and can form both structures



Two neutral walks through sequence space with conservation of structure and catalytic activity

- 1. RNA-Replication *in vitro* und *in vivo*
- 2. Evolution von RNA-Molekülen
- 3. RNA-Sequenzen and -strukturen
- 4. Evolutionäre Optimierung von RNA-Strukturen



Computer simulation using Gillespie's algorithm:

Replication rate constant:

$$f_{\rm k} = \gamma / [\alpha + \Delta d_{\rm S}^{(\rm k)}]$$
$$\Delta d_{\rm S}^{(\rm k)} = d_{\rm H}({\rm S}_{\rm k}, {\rm S}_{\rm t})$$

Selection constraint:

Population size, N = # RNA molecules, is controlled by the flow

 $N(t)\approx\overline{N}\pm\sqrt{\overline{N}}$

Mutation rate: $p = 0.001 / \text{site} \times \text{replication}$

The flowreactor as a device for studies of evolution *in vitro* and *in silico*

random individuals. The primer pair used for genomic DNA amplification is 5'-TCTCCCTGGATTCT-CATTTA-3' (forward) and 5'-TCTTTGTCTTCTGT-TCCACC-3' (reverse). Reactions were performed in 25 µl using 1 unit of Tag DNA polymerase with each primer at 0.4 µM; 200 µM each dATP, dTTP, dGTP. and dCTP: and PCR buffer [10 mM tris-HCl (oH 8.3) 50 mM KCl₂,1.5 mM MgCl₂] in a cycle condition of 94°C for 1 min and then 35 cycles of 94°C for 30 s, 55°C for 30 s, and 72°C for 30 s followed by 72°C for 6 min. PCR products were purified (Qiagen), digested with Xmn I, and separated in a 2% agarose gel.

- 32. A nonsense mutation may affect mRNA stability and result in degradation of the transcript IL. Maguat. Am. J. Hum. Genet. 59, 279 (1996)].
- 33. Data not shown; a dot blot with poly (A)+ RNA from 50 human tissues (The Human RNA Master Blot, 7770-1, Clontech Laboratories) was hybridized with a probe from exons 29 to 47 of MYO15 using the same condition as Northern blot analysis (13).
- 34. Smith-Magenis syndrome (SMS) is due to deletions of 17p11.2 of various sizes, the smallest of which includes MYO15 and perhaps 20 other genes ((6); K-S Chen, L. Potocki, J. R. Lupski, MRDD Res. Rev. 2, 122 (1996)]. MYO15 expression is easily detected in the pituitary gland (data not shown). Haploinsuffi ciency for MYO15 may explain a portion of the SMS

Continuity in Evolution: On the Nature of Transitions

Walter Fontana and Peter Schuster

To distinguish continuous from discontinuous evolutionary change, a relation of nearness between phenotypes is needed. Such a relation is based on the probability of one phenotype being accessible from another through changes in the genotype. This nearness relation is exemplified by calculating the shape neighborhood of a transfer RNA secondary structure and provides a characterization of discontinuous shape transformations in RNA. The simulation of replicating and mutating RNA populations under selection shows that sudden adaptive progress coincides mostly, but not always, with discontinuous shape transformations. The nature of these transformations illuminates the key role of neutral genetic drift in their realization.

A much-debated issue in evolutionary biology concerns the extent to which the history of life has proceeded gradually or has been punctuated by discontinuous transitions at the level of phenotypes (1). Our goal is to make the notion of a discontinuous transition more precise and to understand how it arises in a model of evolutionary adaptation.

We focus on the narrow domain of RNA secondary structure, which is currently the simplest computationally tractable, yet realistic phenotype (2). This choice enables the definition and exploration of concepts that may prove useful in a wider context. RNA secondary structures represent a coarse level of analysis compared with the three-dimensional structure at atomic resolution. Yet, secondary structures are empir-

Institut für Theoretische Chemie, Universität Wien, Währingerstrasse 17, A-1090 Wien, Austria, Santa Fe Institute, 1399 Hyde Park Road, Santa Fe, NM 87501, USA, and International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis (IIASA), A-2361 Laxenburg, Austria.

ically well defined and obtain their biophysical and biochemical importance from being a scaffold for the tertiary structure. For the sake of brevity, we shall refer to secondary structures as "shapes." RNA combines in a single molecule both genotype (replicatable sequence) and phenotype (selectable shape), making it ideally suited for in vitro evolution experiments (3, 4).

phenotype such as short stature. Moreover, a few

SMS patients have sensorineural hearing loss, pos-

sibly because of a point mutation in MYO15 in trans

X-Z. Liu et al., ibid. 17, 268 (1997); F. Gibson et al.,

Nature 374, 62 (1995); D. Weil et al., ibid., p. 60.

BNA was extracted from cochlea (membranous lab-

yrinths) obtained from human fetuses at 18 to 22

weeks of development in accordance with guidelines

established by the Human Research Committee at

the Brigham and Women's Hospital. Only samples

without evidence of degradation were pooled for

poly (A)* selection over oligo(dT) columns. First-

strand cDNA was prepared using an Advantage RT-

for-PCB kit (Clontech Laboratories). A portion of the

first-strand cDNA (4%) was amplified by PCR with

Advantage cDNA polymerase mix (Clontech Labora-

tories) using human MYO15-specific oligonucleotide

primers (forward, 5'-GCATGACCTGCCGGCTAAT-

GGG-3'; reverse, 5'-CTCACGGCTTCTGCATGGT-

GCTCGGCTGGC-3'). Cycling conditions were 40 s

at 94°C; 40 s at 66°C (3 cycles), 60°C (5 cycles), and

55°C (29 cycles); and 45 s at 68°C. PCR products

were visualized by ethidium bromide staining after fractionation in a 1% agarose gel. A 688-bp PCR

36. K. B. Avraham et al., Nature Genet. 11, 369 (1995);

to the SMS 17p11.2 deletion.

35. R. A. Fridell, data not shown.

To generate evolutionary histories, we used a stochastic continuous time model of an RNA population replicating and mutating in a capacity-constrained flow reactor under selection (5, 6). In the laboratory, a goal might be to find an RNA aptamer binding specifically to a molecule (4). Although in the experiment the evolutionary end product was unknown, we thought of its shape as being specified implicitly by the imposed selection criterion. Because our intent is to study evolutionary histories rather than end products, we defined a target shape in advance and assumed the replication rate of a sequence to be a function of because, in contrast to sequences, there are

product is expected from amplification of the human MYO15 cDNA. Amplification of human genomic DNA with this primer pair would result in a 2903-bp fragment

38. We are grateful to the people of Bengkala, Bali, and the two families from India. We thank J. R. Lupski and K.-S. Chen for providing the human chromosome 17 cosmid library. For technical and computational assistance, we thank N. Dietrich, M. Fergusson, A. Gupta, E. Sorbello, R. Torkzadeh, C. Varner, M. Walker, G. Bouffard, and S. Beckstrom-Sternberg (National Institutes of Health Intramural Seguencing Center). We thank J. T. Hinnant, I. N. Arhva. and S. Winata for assistance in Bali, and T. Barber, S. Sullivan, E. Green, D. Dravna, and J. Battey for helpful comments on this manuscript. Supported by the National Institute on Deafness and Other Communication Disorders (NIDCD) (Z01 DC 00035-01 and Z01 DC 00038-01 to T.B.F. and E.R.W. and R01 DC 03402 to C.C.M.), the National Institute of Child Health and Human Development (R01 HD30428 to S.A.C.) and a National Science Foundation Graduate Research Fellowship to F.J.P. This paper is dedicated to J. B. Snow Jr. on his retirement as the Director of the NIDCD.

9 March 1998; accepted 17 April 1998

the similarity between its shape and the target. An actual situation may involve more than one best shape, but this does not affect our conclusions.

An instance representing in its qualitative features all the simulations we performed is shown in Fig. 1A. Starting with identical sequences folding into a random shape, the simulation was stopped when the population became dominated by the target, here a canonical tRNA shape. The black curve traces the average distance to the target (inversely related to fitness) in the population against time. Aside from a short initial phase, the entire history is dominated by steps, that is, flat periods of no apparent adaptive progress, interrupted by sudden approaches toward the target structure (7). However, the dominant shapes in the population not only change at these marked events but undergo several fitness-neutral transformations during the periods of no apparent progress. Although discontinuities in the fitness trace are evident, it is entirely unclear when and on the basis of what the series of successive phenotypes itself can be called continuous or discontinuous.

A set of entities is organized into a (topological) space by assigning to each entity a system of neighborhoods. In the present case, there are two kinds of entities: sequences and shapes, which are related by a thermodynamic folding procedure. The set of possible sequences (of fixed length) is naturally organized into a space because point mutations induce a canonical neighborhood. The neighborhood of a sequence consists of all its one-error mutants. The problem is how to organize the set of possible shapes into a space. The issue arises

Evolution *in silico*

W. Fontana, P. Schuster, Science 280 (1998), 1451-1455





In silico optimization in the flow reactor: Evolutionary Trajectory





Phenylalanyl-tRNA as target structure

28 neutral point mutations during a long quasi-stationary epoch



entry	GGUAUGGGCGUUGAAUAGUAGGGUUUAAACCAAUCGGCCAACGAUCUCGUGUGCGCAUUUCAUAUCCCGUACAGAA
8	.(((((((((((((()))))))))((((((
exit	GGUAUGGGCGUUGAAUAAUAGGGUUUAAACCAAUCGGCCAACGAUCUCGUGUGCGCAUUUCAUAUCCCAUACAGAA
entry	GGUAUGGGCGUUGAAUAAUAGGGUUUAAACCAAUCGGCCAACGAUCUCGUGUGCGCAUUUCAUAUACCAUACAGAA
9	.((((((((((((((((((((()))))))))))))))))
exit	UGGAUGGACGUUGAAUAACAAGGUAUCGACCAAACAACCAAC
entry	UGGAUGGACGUUGAAUAACAAGGUAUCGACCAAACAACCAAC
10	((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((((
exit	UGGAUGGACGUUGAAUAACAAGGUAUCGACCAAACAACCAAC

Transition inducing point mutations change the molecular structure Neutral point mutations leave the molecular structure unchanged

Neutral genotype evolution during phenotypic stasis







Genotype space

Cost function



Genotype space



A sketch of optimization on neutral networks

Acknowledgement of support

Fonds zur Förderung der wissenschaftlichen Forschung (FWF)

Projects No. 09942, 10578, 11065, 13093 13887, and 14898

Jubiläumsfonds der Österreichischen Nationalbank

Project No. Nat-7813

European Commission: Project No. EU-980189

Austrian Genome Research Program – GEN-AU

Siemens AG, Austria

The Santa Fe Institute and the Universität Wien

The software for producing RNA movies was developed by Robert Giegerich and coworkers at the Universität Bielefeld



Universität Wien

Coworkers



Walter Fontana, Santa Fe Institute, NM

Christian Reidys, Christian Forst, Los Alamos National Laboratory, NM

Peter Stadler, Bärbel Stadler, Universität Leipzig, GE

Jord Nagel, Kees Pleij, Universiteit Leiden, NL

Ivo L.Hofacker, Christoph Flamm, Universität Wien, AT

Andreas Wernitznig, Michael Kospach, Universität Wien, AT Ulrike Langhammer, Ulrike Mückstein, Stefanie Widder Jan Cupal, Kurt Grünberger, Andreas Svrček-Seiler, Stefan Wuchty Stefan Bernhart, Lukas Endler

Ulrike Göbel, Institut für Molekulare Biotechnologie, Jena, GE Walter Grüner, Stefan Kopp, Jaqueline Weber Universität Wien

Thank you for your attention!

Web-Page for further information:

http://www.tbi.univie.ac.at/~pks